

MINUTES OF THE
MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS
AIR QUALITY TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING

Thursday, June 1, 2017
MAG Office
Phoenix, Arizona

MEMBERS ATTENDING

Tim Conner, Scottsdale, Chairman	* Dave Berry, Arizona Motor Transport Association
Jamie McCullough, El Mirage, Vice Chair	Liz Foster, Maricopa County Farm Bureau
Drew Bryck, Avondale	# Steve Trussell, Arizona Rock Products Association
Susan Avans for Robert van den Akker, Buckeye	* Greater Phoenix Chamber of Commerce
Jon Sherrill, Chandler	# Amanda McGennis, Associated General Contractors
# Jamie Zanazzo for Hondo Judd, Gilbert	* Spencer Kamps, Homebuilders Association of Central Arizona
# Megan Sheldon, Glendale	# Mannie Carpenter, Valley Forward
* Cato Esquivel, Goodyear	* Kai Umeda, University of Arizona Cooperative Extension
# Kazi Haque, Maricopa	Beverly Chenausky, Arizona Department of Transportation
Greg Edwards, Mesa	Mike Sonenberg for Brian Parkey, Arizona Department of Environmental Quality
Rhonda Humbles for Stuart Kent, Peoria	* Environmental Protection Agency
Joe Giudice, Phoenix	Hether Krause, Maricopa County Air Quality Department
# Antonio DeLaCruz, Surprise	Scott DiBiase, Pinal County
Oddvar Tveit, Tempe	# Michelle Wilson, Arizona Department of Agriculture, Weights and Measures
* Youngtown	@ Ed Stillings, Federal Highway Administration
# Ramona Simpson, Queen Creek	James Winfrey for Judi Nelson, Arizona State University
# Karen Creasey for Walter Bouchard, American Lung Association of Arizona	Stan Belone, Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community
Kristin Watt, Salt River Project	
* Rebecca Hudson-Nunez, Southwest Gas Corporation	
Michael Denby, Arizona Public Service Company	
* Gina Grey, Western States Petroleum Association	
# Amanda Luecker for Robert Forrest, Valley Metro/RPTA	

* Members neither present nor represented by proxy.

Participated via telephone conference call.

+ Participated via video conference call.

@ Ex-Officio member, non-voting member.

OTHERS PRESENT

Lindy Bauer, Maricopa Association of Governments	Joonwon Joo, Arizona Department of Transportation
Julie Hoffman, Maricopa Association of Governments	Phil Cummings, Maricopa County Air Quality Department
Matt Poppen, Maricopa Association of Governments	Maria Cody, Maricopa County Air Quality Department
Kara Johnson, Maricopa Association of Governments	Sam Brown, City of Scottsdale
Dean Giles, Maricopa Association of Governments	Joe Gibbs, City of Phoenix
Taejoo Shin, Maricopa Association of Governments	Catherine Lucke-McDowell, Arizona Department of Environmental Quality
Randy Sedlacek, Maricopa Association of Governments	Lauren Whittaker, City of Mesa
Alison Walker, Maricopa Association of Governments	

1. Call to Order

A meeting of the Maricopa Association of Governments (MAG) Air Quality Technical Advisory Committee (AQTAC) was conducted on June 1, 2017. Tim Conner, City of Scottsdale, Chair, called the meeting to order at approximately 1:35 p.m. Jamie Zanazzo, Town of Gilbert; Megan Sheldon, City of Glendale; Ramona Simpson, Town of Queen Creek; Kazi Haque, City of Maricopa; Mannie Carpenter, Valley Forward; Amanda McGennis, Associated General Contractors; Michelle Wilson, Arizona Department of Agriculture - Weights and Measures; Karen Creasey, American Lung Association of Arizona; Steve Trussell, Arizona Rock Products Association; Amanda Luecker, Valley Metro; and Antonio DeLaCruz, City of Surprise, attended the meeting via telephone conference call.

Greg Edwards, City of Mesa, noted that he will be retiring from the City of Mesa on July 14, 2017. He stated that it has been a pleasure to serve on the Committee. Mr. Edwards introduced Lauren Whittaker who will be the Mesa representative on the Committee upon retirement.

Chair Conner indicated that copies of the handouts for the meeting are available. He noted for members attending through audio conference, the presentations for the meeting will be posted on the MAG website under Resources for the Committee agenda, whenever possible. If it is not possible to post them before the meeting, they will be posted after the meeting.

2. Call to the Audience

Chair Conner stated that the Call to the Audience provides an opportunity for members of the public to address the Committee on items not scheduled on the agenda that fall under the jurisdiction of MAG, or on items on the agenda for discussion but not for action. Comment cards for those wishing to speak are available on the tables adjacent to the doorways inside the meeting room. Members of the public will be requested not to exceed a three minute time period for their comments. A total of 15 minutes will be provided for the Call to the Audience agenda item, unless the Committee requests an exception to this limit. Please note that those wishing to comment on action agenda items will be given an opportunity at the time the item is heard. Chair Conner noted that no public comment cards had been received.

3. Approval of the April 27, 2017 Meeting Minutes

The Committee reviewed the minutes from the April 27, 2017 meeting. Greg Edwards, City of Mesa, requested that the City of Mesa proxy John Meyer name be modified in the minutes for the correct spelling of his name. Ms. McGennis moved and Joe Giudice, City of Phoenix, seconded, and the motion to approve the April 27, 2017 meeting minutes with the correction carried unanimously.

4. Draft 2017 MAG Conformity Analysis for the Draft FY 2018-2022 MAG Transportation Improvement Program and Draft 2040 MAG Regional Transportation Plan

Dean Giles, Maricopa Association of Governments, presented the Draft 2017 Conformity Analysis prepared by MAG for the Draft Fiscal Year (FY) 2018-2022 MAG Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) and Draft 2040 MAG Regional Transportation Plan (RTP). He indicated that the Clean Air Act links transportation and air quality. The Clean Air Act requires that transportation plans, programs, and projects conform to the purpose of the air quality plans.

Conformity ensures that transportation activities do not cause violations of the air quality standards. Mr. Giles noted that air quality plans establish motor vehicle emissions budgets that are used in the regional emissions analysis.

Mr. Giles discussed the conformity requirements. He stated that to demonstrate conformity the TIP and RTP must pass the conformity emissions tests, as well as the latest planning assumptions and emissions models. The TIP and RTP must also provide for the timely implementation of transportation measures. Also, MAG conducts consultation on the draft documents.

Mr. Giles stated that the expanded MAG Metropolitan Planning Area (MPA) boundary and the Sun Corridor Metropolitan Planning Organization (MPO) MPA boundary include portions of the Pinal County PM-10 and PM-2.5 nonattainment areas. Both Pinal County nonattainment areas are completely covered by the two MPOs. Mr. Giles presented a map that displayed the Pinal County PM-10 nonattainment area in red and the PM-2.5 nonattainment in red crosshatch. Transportation conformity is required to be demonstrated for both nonattainment areas by both MPOs. MAG is preparing the conformity analyses for the Pinal County nonattainment areas to aid the Sun Corridor MPO.

Mr. Giles provided the conformity results for the Maricopa County nonattainment and maintenance areas. For carbon monoxide, the projected emissions for all analysis years are less than the budget from the MAG 2013 Carbon Monoxide Maintenance Plan. For eight-hour ozone, the projected VOC emissions are less than the 2008 budget in the MAG 2007 Eight-Hour Ozone Plan and less than the 2025 budget in the MAG 2009 Eight-Hour Ozone Maintenance Plan, and the projected NOx emissions are less than the 2008 budget in the MAG 2007 Eight-Hour Ozone Plan and less than the 2025 budget in the MAG 2009 Eight-Hour Ozone Maintenance Plan. For PM-10, the projected emissions for all analysis years are less than the 2006 budget in the Revised MAG 1999 Serious Area PM-10 Plan and less than the 2012 budget in the MAG 2012 Five Percent Plan for PM-10. He displayed a chart for the transportation control measure funding in the FY 2018-2022 TIP for meeting the requirements of timely implementation of transportation control measures.

Mr. Giles provided the conformity results for the Pinal County nonattainment areas. For the PM-10 nonattainment area, for all analysis years the projected PM-10 emissions in the action scenario are not greater than the projected emissions in the baseline scenario. For the PM-2.5 nonattainment area, for all analysis years the projected PM-2.5 emissions in the action scenario are not greater than the projected emissions in the baseline scenario and the projected NOx emissions in the action scenario are not greater than the projected emissions in the baseline scenario.

Mr. Giles stated that the results of the Conformity Analysis conducted for the Draft FY 2018-2022 MAG Transportation Improvement Program and Draft 2040 MAG Regional Transportation Plan conclude that the conformity requirements have been met and a Finding of Conformity is supported.

Mr. Giles discussed the conformity schedule. He indicated that on April 26, 2017 the draft documents were made available for a 30-day public review period with comments on the draft documents requested by May 25, 2017. On May 25, 2017, EPA indicated that they concurred with the Draft 2017 Conformity Analysis. On May 9, 2017 MAG conducted a public hearing

on the draft documents and no comments were received on the Draft 2017 Conformity Analysis. Today, the Committee may make a recommendation to approve the Draft 2017 Conformity Analysis. The Draft 2017 MAG Conformity Analysis would then continue to the MAG Management Committee on June 14, 2017. On June 28, 2017, the MAG Regional Council may take approval action. The Finding of Conformity is anticipated in July 2017 by the U.S. Department of Transportation.

Chair Conner requested a motion to recommend approval of the Draft 2017 MAG Conformity Analysis for the Draft FY 2018-2022 MAG Transportation Improvement Program and Draft 2040 MAG Regional Transportation Plan. Scott DiBiase, Pinal County, moved, and Mike Sonenberg, Arizona Department of Environmental Quality, seconded, and the motion to recommend approval of the Draft 2017 MAG Conformity Analysis carried unanimously.

5. Maricopa County Trip Reduction Program

Phil Cummings, Maricopa County Air Quality Department, presented the Maricopa County Trip Reduction Program (TRP). He stated that in 1985 the State of Arizona wrote the program into a State Implementation Plan (SIP) to comply with the Ambient Air Quality Standards. The Arizona Legislature passed the 1988 Air Quality Bill, ARS 49-581 et seq., which mandated a Travel Reduction Program for employers and schools in Maricopa County. Mr. Cummings noted in 1997 a Maricopa County Ordinance, P-7, was added to provide for the statutory compliance of the TRP. He stated that the P-7 allowed for Equivalent Emission Reduction (EER) credits that allowed employers additional opportunities for implementation and tracking of the TRP that benefit air quality. Mr. Cummings stated that the FY 2017 TRP is funded by grants from the Arizona Department of Environmental Quality (ADEQ) and MAG.

Mr. Cummings discussed the TRP mission. The mission of the TRP is to improve air quality by affecting a long-term change in the commuting behavior of employers and students. He stated that approximately 600,000 employees are surveyed through their employers, one third of the population of the region. Mr. Cummings commented that the TRP is unique in that data from a large percentage of the population is available to analyze commuting patterns. He indicated that an annual survey is conducted that requests employee commuting data from employers. The data is analyzed for single occupant vehicle trips and miles traveled in hopes of reducing single occupancy commutes.

Mr. Cummings stated that Maricopa County provides research, planning, coordination, and regulatory aspects of the TRP. The research analysis includes: data collection through the annual survey; reporting program results to the State, County, MAG, and anyone interested in the data; and producing employer survey analysis reports. Mr. Cummings stated that the plan review and monitoring includes: conducting annual employer compliance audits; reviewing plans and recommending plan enhancements; and managing enforcement actions, such as Notice of Violation (NOV) for noncompliance.

Mr. Cummings discussed the FY 2016 TRP accomplishments. He stated that the program includes 3,075 major employer sites and 126 student sites. Mr. Cummings reported that 1,075 TRP plans were received in FY 2016. He noted that 1,248 site and phone audits were completed that provide assistance and guidance to employers. The monthly TRP Regional Task Force approved 1,009 TRP plans in FY 2016.

Mr. Cummings discussed research and analysis of the TRP survey from FY 2016. He indicated that 792,100 TRP participants were surveyed on commuting habits which included both employers and students. Approximately 451,000 are surveyed through an electronic survey on the internet or intranet. The electronic surveys have helped reduce costs and increased data accuracy. Mr. Cummings stated that based on the survey results, TRP survey participants have prevented 12,849 tons of pollution. He added that 84,000 pounds of pollution per day is prevented by TRP participants based on MAG calculation that 80.1 miles driven produce one pound of pollution. The total alternative vehicles miles traveled daily in FY 2016, by bus, bike, walk, car/vanpool, compressed work week, and telecommute, was 4,926,367.

Mr. Cummings presented the TRP survey. He stated that the survey is provided in English and Spanish. Mr. Cummings noted that the survey for employers and students differs. Mr. Cummings stated that the current survey is one page long. He encouraged everyone to fill out the survey in its entirety because each data point is valuable. MAG utilizes the data for modeling. City of Phoenix has planned bus routes utilizing the data.

Mr. Cummings discussed compliance assistance. He stated that Maricopa County works with the employers at every step of the TRP process. If employers repeatedly fail to collect and supply documentation and fail to disseminate program information or implement the plan, Maricopa County staff may issue a Request for Documents (RFD) and Notice of Violations. If an employer has unresolved RFD and NOVs, the company is invited to attend TRP Regional Task Force meetings in which the TRP Regional Task Force and TRP staff work with the County Attorney's Office. The TRP Regional Task Force may vote to recommend a civil penalty by statute. Mr. Cummings indicated that civil penalties are only utilized as a last resort.

Mr. Cummings displayed the employer two page Travel Reduction Plan. The employer is allowed to add specialty circumstances to the plan that provide an air quality benefit.

Mr. Cummings discussed the Maricopa County TRP Regional Task Force. The members are appointed by the Board of Supervisors. Up to three members may be appointed in each supervisory district. There are currently nine members. Mr. Cummings stated that the TRP Regional Task Force is also accepting new members. The TRP Regional Task Force meets monthly and provides program oversight and recommendations to the Board of Supervisors.

Mr. Cummings discussed outreach and training. Valley Metro Commute Solutions provides employer outreach, training, and Clean Air Campaign activities. Mr. Cummings commented that Maricopa County and Valley Metro educate employers and the general public about the goals and requirements of the TRP. He added that outreach for TRP involves events and education at schools.

Lindy Bauer, Maricopa Association of Governments, stated that the Trip Reduction Program is very important and it is a committed measure in air quality plans. She indicated that the TRP survey data is extremely important data that MAG utilizes in a variety of ways, including: transportation networks; member agency transit planning; and economic development. Ms. Bauer thanked Maricopa County for their work on the Trip Reduction Program and for providing a reminder on the importance of the program.

Mr. Cummings added that large companies in the TRP have become leaders in the region for the program. He noted that it is also important to encourage, connect, and collect data from smaller

companies as well. Mr. Cummings thanked MAG for helping develop a new database for the program.

Mr. Giudice inquired about the ADEQ funding source for the TRP. Mr. Sonenberg replied that he is unsure of the ADEQ funding source for the TRP. He stated that he can report back to Mr. Giudice on the ADEQ funding source.

Mr. Giudice commented that the region is growing. He asked if Maricopa County works with the Greater Phoenix Economic Council (GPEC) or other economic development agencies on opportunities to involve companies into the TRP that are moving into or being developed in the area. Mr. Cummings responded that the program does not work with GPEC, however Maricopa County aims to connect with new companies and businesses moving into the region through the Chamber of Commerce and other means. He commented that the TRP staff is small. Mr. Cummings stated that the TRP is constantly updating lists. Mr. Cummings commented that large companies are not difficult to connect with, however smaller companies are more difficult to connect with. Mr. Giudice clarified that larger companies are required to participate in the TRP. Mr. Cummings replied that is correct. Mr. Giudice mentioned recent news articles on large businesses expanding into the region.

Mr. Giudice inquired about per capita alternative commuting trends or patterns. Mr. Cummings responded that carpooling has seen the largest increase with the carpool rate at approximately 10 to 12 percent. He commented that the increase in carpooling can likely be attributed to economics and high occupancy vehicle lanes on freeways. Mr. Cummings stated that the preferred alternative modes fluctuate in that bicycles have also seen frequent periods of increased use as well, especially with students. He indicated that the single occupancy vehicle rate is approximately 75 percent in which 25 percent of trips are alternative commute options. Mr. Cummings indicated that 25 percent of people are doing at least one alternative commute option every week.

Michael Denby, Arizona Public Service, commented that students utilize other modes of alternative transportation such as skateboards.

Mr. Sonenberg asked if data is available on what activities are most effective to encourage alternative mode commuting. Mr. Cummings replied that the data exists, however it will be easier to extract from the new database. He noted that the data on effective strategies will be readily available in approximately a year.

6. Air Quality Monitoring Data

Julie Hoffman, Maricopa Association of Governments, provided an update on air quality monitoring data for ozone, PM-10, and PM-2.5. She stated that air quality monitoring data materials for 2017 were provided at each place.

Ms. Hoffman discussed the 2017 ozone monitoring data. She stated that there has been one day in 2017 where the region exceeded the 2008 eight-hour ozone standard of 0.075 parts per million (ppm). On April 15, 2017, the Humboldt Mountain and North Phoenix monitors exceeded the 0.075 ppm standard. Ms. Hoffman stated that there have been twelve days so far this year where exceedances of the 2015 eight-hour ozone standard of 0.070 ppm have occurred. She noted that

while there have been 12 exceedance days, it is important to look at concentrations based on how the standard is calculated, which is the three year average of the annual fourth high.

Ms. Hoffman presented the three year average of the annual fourth high for 2015-2017 by monitor. She stated that the 2017 values are based on preliminary data through May 30, 2017. Ms. Hoffman indicated that there are no violations of the 0.075 ppm standard. She noted that the North Phoenix monitor has a current three year average of the fourth high value of 0.074 ppm. However, in order for the monitor to violate the standard, a fourth high value of 0.079 ppm in 2017 would be required, due to the values in 2015 and 2016. Ms. Hoffman noted that a concentration of 0.079 ppm has not been seen at the North Phoenix monitor in the past two years. She stated that the region is expected to meet the 0.075 ppm standard in 2017 due to the downward trend in ozone concentrations.

Ms. Hoffman reported that the sites violating the 2015 eight-hour ozone standard of 0.070 ppm are shown in bold; there are currently eight violating monitors. In 2016, there were nine monitors in the nonattainment area violating the 0.070 ppm standard. Ms. Hoffman stated that MAG will continue to closely track the ozone monitoring data.

Ms. Hoffman discussed the 2017 exceedances of the 24-hour PM-10 standard. She stated that the West 43rd Avenue monitor exceeded the PM-10 standard on March 30, 2017 and the Buckeye monitor exceeded the PM-10 standard on May 7, 2017. Ms. Hoffman indicated that both exceedances were due to high wind dust events and have been flagged as exceptional events. She stated that the region continues to meet the 24-hour PM-10 standard.

Ms. Hoffman stated that there has been one exceedance of the 24-hour PM-2.5 standard in 2017, which occurred on January 8, 2017 at the West Phoenix monitor due to residential woodburning activity. She indicated that the region continues to attain the 24-hour PM-2.5 standard.

7. New Committee Chair and Vice Chair

Ms. Bauer stated that on May 15, 2017 the MAG Regional Council Executive Committee appointed Jamie McCullough, City of El Mirage, as the new Chair of the MAG AQTAC and Jon Sherrill, City of Chandler, as the new Vice Chair. According to the MAG Committee Operating Policies and Procedures, the term of office is two years. The terms will begin July 1, 2017.

8. Call for Future Agenda Items

Chair Conner indicated that the next meeting of the Committee has been scheduled for Thursday, June 29, 2017 at 1:30 p.m. He requested suggestions for future agenda items. With no further comments, the meeting was adjourned at approximately 2:10 p.m.